

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

YOUNG AMERICA'S FOUNDATION;  
BINGHAMTON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE  
REPUBLICANS; and JON LIZAK, President  
of the College Republicans of Binghamton  
University,

Civil Action 3:20-cv-822  
(LEK/ML)

Plaintiffs,

v.

HARVEY STENGER, President of SUNY-Binghamton,  
in his official and individual capacities; BRIAN ROSE,  
Vice President for Student Affairs of SUNY-  
Binghamton, in his official and individual capacities;  
JOHN PELLETIER, Chief of SUNY-Binghamton  
UPD, in his official and individual capacities;  
STUDENT ASSOCIATION  
OF BINGHAMTON UNIVERSITY,

**STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS**

Defendants..

Pursuant to Rule 56.1 of the Local Rules for the United States District Court for the Northern District of New York, the following is a statement of material facts about which the Student Association of Binghamton University, Inc., (hereinafter referred to as the SA), contends there exist no genuine issue;

1. The SA is an entity independent and separate from Binghamton University. See paragraph 4 of the Affidavit of Daniel Croce dated May 30, 2024, (hereinafter referred to as the Croce affidavit).
2. Neither the University Administration nor the University Police (hereinafter referred to as UPD), has representation of the SA Executive Board. See par. 4 of the Croce affidavit.
3. The University has no role and is not consulted in approving disciplinary action against a chartered student organization. See par. 5 of the Croce affidavit.
4. On November 14, 2019, the College Republicans held a tabling event on the Spine in an area that

required a reservation to be made through the University's B-there platform. See par. 10 of the affidavit on Erin Bishop, dated May 24, 2024, (hereinafter referred to as the Bishop affidavit). See also p.67 of (Dkt 254-7).

5. Reservation for tabling events on the Spine are made exclusively through the University's B-there platform which is operated by the University. The SA does not handle requests for tabling reservations. See par. 6 of the Bishop affidavit.

6. The College Republicans did not obtain a reservation for this event which violated the University's tabling policy. See par. 10 of the Bishop affidavit.

7. Members of the SA as well as Erin Bishop personally witnessed the College Republicans holding the tabling event that day. See par. 9 of the Bishop affidavit.

8. During the course of the tabling event, the College Republicans were advised by the UPD and members of the SA staff that they were violating the tabling/reservation policy and would have to move off the reserved areas of the spine. See par. 11 of the Bishop affidavit. See also Narrative Report of UPD Officer Brian Ackley, dated November 14, 2019, which is attached as exhibit B of the affidavit of Thomas A. Saitta, dated May 31, 2024.

9. After being asked to move by the UPD and a member of the SA staff the College Republicans refused to do so. See par. 11 of the Bishop affidavit. See also Narrative Report of UPD Officer Brian Ackley, dated November 14, 2019, which is attached as exhibit B of the affidavit of Thomas A. Saitta, dated May 31, 2024.

10. Based on the College Republican's violation of the tabling/reservation policy, their access to the organizations B-there account was suspended for one academic year. See par. 5 of the Bishop affidavit.

11. The suspension of access to the College Republican's B-there account was the only sanction

imposed by the SA for their violation of the reservation/tabling policy. Neither their charter nor funding was affected by this sanction. See par. 8 of the Bishop affidavit.

12. The sanction imposed for this violation was consistent with the SA's policies on organizational sanctions of chartered student organizations by the Executive Vice President of the SA. See par. 12 of the Bishop Affidavit.

13. Pursuant to SA policies, all chartered student organization must by the end of the spring semester, re-register for the coming academic year by providing the SA with a list of their officers and attend a leadership training session conducted by the SA. See par. 3 of the affidavit of Maggie Koekkoek dated May 30, 2024 (hereinafter referred to as the Koekkoek affidavit).

14. Failure to re-register results in an organization's charter being temporarily frozen. Additionally, it is hidden from the University's B-engaged platform, it cannot participate in U-Fest and it is unable to access its budget. See par. 4 of the Koekkoek affidavit.

15. On May 18, 2019, the College Republicans and various other chartered student organizations were notified that they had failed to re-register for the next academic year. See par. 5 of the Koekkoek affidavit.

16. Subsequently, Ms. Koekkoek worked with the College Republicans to meet the re-registration requirements so their charter would not be revoked. See pars. 7-13 of the Koekkoek affidavit.

17. Following disruption of the Laffer speech on November 18, 2019, Defendant Rose met with Officers of the SA requested that they sanction the College Progressives as an organization, on the basis that some of its members had disrupted the event. See par. 9 of the Croce affidavit.

18. The SA does not have the authority to sanction individual students for violation of University Policies. It can only sanction organizational conduct. See par. 9 of the Croce affidavit.

19. Additionally, he subsequently produced an unsigned letter, (hereinafter referred to as the

statement), urging the disruption of the event which he claimed showed the College Progressive's involvement in the disruption. See par. 10 of the Croce affidavit.

20. The statement was not signed by any officer or member of the College Progressives or bore any indicia that it was a statement from or approved by the College Progressives as an organization. See par. 11 of the Croce affidavit.

21. On December 6, 2019, Erin Bishop wrote to Defendant Rose asked him to provide the E-mail transmitting the statement to see if it would help confirm the College Progressive adoption or approval of the statement. Defendant Rose did not do so. See par 13 of the Croce affidavit.

22. In the fall of 2019 Daniel O'Keefe submitted an application to have a chapter of Young Americans for Freedom, (hereinafter referred to as the YAF), chartered as a student organization by the SA.

23. Initially, Shirley Hu, an SA Constitutions Assistant, raised a concern about a provision in the YAF's proposed constitution. However, after consultation with the SA's internal affairs committee, she informed Mr. O'Keefe that the language in question was acceptable. See pars. 18-20 of the Croce affidavit.

24. By E-mail dated November 20, 2019, the SA's insurance carrier informed them that they could only include the YAF under the SA's policy if the group arranged to have a faculty advisor or security at their speaking/debating events. See par. 22 of the Croce affidavit.

25. The YAF has not agreed to the carrier's condition and its charter application is still pending. See par. 23 of the Croce affidavit.

May 31, 2024



Thomas A. Saitta, Esq.  
Aswad & Ingraham, LLP  
Attorneys for Defendant Student Association of  
Binghamton University, Inc.

46 Front St.  
Binghamton, NY 13905  
(607)-722-3495  
[tom.saitta@ailaw.com](mailto:tom.saitta@ailaw.com)

TO:

Andrew Hruska, Esq. & Joseph Zales, Esq.  
King, Spaulding Law Firm - NY Office  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
1185 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-4003  
212-556-2278  
Email: [ahruska@kslaw.com](mailto:ahruska@kslaw.com)  
Email: [jzales@kslaw.com](mailto:jzales@kslaw.com)

Jonathan A. Scruggs, Esq. & Tyson Charles Langhofer, Esq.  
Alliance Defending Freedom - AZ Office  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
15100 N. 90th Street Scottsdale, AZ 85260  
480-444-0020  
Email: [jscruggs@alliancedefendingfreedom.org](mailto:jscruggs@alliancedefendingfreedom.org)  
Email: [tlanghofer@adflegal.org](mailto:tlanghofer@adflegal.org)

**Letitia James**

Attorney General of the State of New York  
Attorney for Defendants Stenger, Rose and Pelletier  
The Capitol  
Albany, New York 12224-0341  
By: John F. Moore  
Bar Roll No. 105188  
Telephone: (518) 776-2293  
Email: [John.Moore@ag.ny.gov](mailto:John.Moore@ag.ny.gov)

**Matthew J. Larkin**

Barclay Damon LLP - Syracuse Office  
Barclay Damon Tower  
Attorneys for Defendant Harvey Stenger

in his official and individual capacity  
125 East Jefferson Street  
Syracuse, NY 13202  
315-425-2805  
Fax: 315-703-6247  
Email: [mlarkin@barclaydamon.com](mailto:mlarkin@barclaydamon.com)

**David M. Fulvio**  
Barclay Damon LLP - Rochester Office  
Attorneys for Defendant Harvey Stenger  
in his official and individual capacity  
2000 Five Star Bank Plaza  
100 Chestnut Street  
Rochester, NY 14604-2072  
585-295-4432  
Email: [dfulvio@barclaydamon.com](mailto:dfulvio@barclaydamon.com)

**Nicholas Constantino**  
Barclay Damon LLP - Syracuse Office  
Attorneys for Defendant Harvey Stenger  
in his official and individual capacity  
Barclay Damon Tower  
125 East Jefferson Street  
Syracuse, NY 13202  
607-597-9526  
Email: [nconstantino@barclaydamon.com](mailto:nconstantino@barclaydamon.com)

**Louis P. DiLorenzo**  
Bond Schoeneck & King, PLLC - NYC Office  
Attorneys for Defendant Brian Rose in his  
official and individual capacity  
600 Third Avenue, 22nd Floor  
New York, NY 10016  
646-253-2300  
Fax: 646-253-2301  
Email: [Dilorel@bsk.com](mailto:Dilorel@bsk.com)

**Mallory A. Campbell**  
Bond Schoeneck & King, PLLC - NYC Office  
Attorneys for Defendant Brian Rose in his

official and individual capacity  
600 Third Avenue, 22nd Floor  
New York, NY 10016  
646-253-2339  
Email: [mcampbell@bsk.com](mailto:mcampbell@bsk.com)

**Melly M. Ryan**  
Goldberg, Segalla Law Firm - Syracuse Office  
Attorneys for John Pelletier in his official  
individual capacity  
5786 Widewaters Parkway  
Syracuse, NY 13214  
315-413-5400  
Fax: 315-413-5401  
Email: [mryan@goldbergsegalla.com](mailto:mryan@goldbergsegalla.com)

**Meghan Brown**  
Goldberg Segalla, LLP  
Attorneys for John Pelletier in his official  
individual capacity  
665 Main Street  
Buffalo, NY 14203-1425  
716-566-5400  
Email: [mbrown@goldbergsegalla.com](mailto:mbrown@goldbergsegalla.com)